

23-02 Civil Service Audit - Follow-up



Internal Audit Division

Status of Corrective Action Plans

As of July, 2024

Original Report Issuance - February 2024

Follow-up result:

Findings #1, #5, & #7 are partially implemented and will need additional follow-up in six months;

Findings #2, #3, #4, & #6 are implemented and closed.

Civil Service

Finding	Recommendations	Corrective Action Plan
1 Clarify Program Administration		
An impetus for this audit was a sense of confusion from hiring managers as to who administers the various functions and processes relating to position description development, position minimum qualifications, position classifications, position recruitment, hiring, promotions or reclassifications, and employee discipline.	We recommend the City Manager clarify the responsibilities of the Civil Service Commission and also clarify the duties the City Manager has delegated to other managers as permitted in the City Charter.	The City of Reno Charter very clearly defines the areas in which the Commission has authority over and is responsible for in Article IX – Civil Service. The City Manager does not have authority to clarify and/or delegate the responsibilities of the Commission or the Chief Examiner. The Commission, Chief Examiner and attorney will as needed provide clarification. The Commission and attorney will provide direction to the Chief Examiner and staff in this matter.
Confusion in the hiring process may reduce confidence in the hiring and promoting process and potential delays in recruitments.	In addition, we recommend the City Manager and Civil Service Commission assess if there are potential changes to the Charter which would clarify the role of the Civil Service.	An educational presentation and training will be developed to present to the City Manager, Department Directors and hiring managers regarding the authority and responsibilities of the Commission. Educational presentation will be developed by March 31, 2024 and will be presented at our regularly scheduled 2nd quarterly hiring team meetings. Quarterly meetings are with all departments and include Directors, hiring managers, and NeoGov liaisons. These meetings will be completed by June 30, 2024.
<p><u>The Civil Service recommendation has been implemented.</u></p> <p>During the first quarter hiring team meetings training was provided on the different roles of Civil Service and Human Resources in regards to city hiring. A info-graphic was provided that will be uploaded for reference on our BLI page in July. NeoGov training was provided to all HR liasons to educate them in their role in the hiring process. Civil Service partnered with Human Resources to present Interviewing & Hiring - Legal & Effective as part of the Leadership Track Learning Series in February/March. This training highlighted the roles of hiring managers and the Civil Service requirements they need to follow during the hiring process. Unable to gain access to Moodle (the City's Learning System) to produce ongoing training at this time.</p> <p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> While the recommendation implementation for Civil Service has been completed, Internal Audit will follow-up on a the status of the comprehensive and iterative formal training program in coordination with HR.</p>		
		<p>The City Manager will work with HR to lead a review of RMC 9.180 to identify and assign responsibilities of Human Resources and Civil Service related to classification and compensation.</p> <p>A Classification and Compensation Guidelines Manual is identified as a deliverable in the current classification and compensation project to be completed by February 2024.</p>
<p><u>The City Manager's Office recommendation has been partially implemented.</u></p> <p>Section 9.180 is contained within the Reno City Charter, not the Reno Municipal Code. Changes to the Reno City Charter require an act of the Nevada State legislature, and thus necessitates a more long-term timeline to facilitate a revision to that language. As an intermediary remedy responsive to this audit finding, City Policy 406 - Employee Hiring Process was significantly revised to provide hiring managers with clarification as to the steps in the hiring process. These revisions were adopted effective 05/13/2024. The Classification and Compensation Guidelines Manual is still in development as the results of the classification and compensation study have not been holistically implemented.</p> <p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> Internal Audit will follow-up with the City Manager's Office on the progress for the Classification and Compensation Guidelines Manual as well as any updates to the Reno City Charter for the upcoming 2025 Legislative Session.</p>		

Finding	Recommendations	Corrective Action Plan
<p>2 Clarify Due Diligence Responsibilities</p> <p>The expectation of who performs due diligence tasks and how it should be performed in the recruitment and hiring process is unclear. A lack of clear due diligence responsibilities creates the risk that unqualified applicants being advanced and potentially hired.</p>	<p>We recommend the Chief Examiner clarify the due diligence responsibilities between Civil Service, Human Resources, and departmental hiring managers, and train applicable staff on this formal, iterative process.</p>	<p>As addressed in finding 1., Civil Service staff will develop and present for educational purposes the recruitment and hiring areas of responsibility that fall within the purview of the Civil Service Commission. This presentation will continue to expand upon the routine training currently being provided to hiring managers and other applicable staff on the recruitment lifecycle, Subject Matter Expert (SME) criteria and selection, job analysis, competency mapping, assessment development, certification of eligibles procedures and probationary periods.</p> <p>A formal SOP will be developed regarding the due diligence process Civil Service utilizes from application receipt through placement on an eligible list. Training will be provided to Civil Service staff on an annual basis to ensure consistency throughout the delivery of our uniform process.</p> <p>Educational presentation will be developed by March 31, 2024, and will be presented at our regularly scheduled 2nd quarterly hiring team meetings. Quarterly meetings are with all departments and include Directors, hiring managers, and NeoGov liaisons. These meetings will be completed by June 30, 2024.</p> <p>SOP to be complete and available for training by June 30, 2024. Training to commence immediately following.</p> <p>The timeframe for posting the reference material to the Civil Service BLI page is subject to coordination with Human Resources but anticipated to be completed by March 31, 2024.</p> <p>Civil Service staff will work with Human Resources to develop a hiring process flow chart that will identify the responsibilities of Human Resources, Civil Service and Department hiring managers and post this to our BLI page for reference.</p>
<p><u>Recommendation has been implemented.</u></p> <p>During the second quarter hiring team meetings training was provided on the global hiring process from vacancy to onboarding. A Ready to Hire Check-list was developed and distributed during these meetings and will be made available as an interactive document on the Civil Service BLI page in July. At this training, departments were provided information on the required steps of the hiring process as well as best practices and recommended steps. They were also informed of the responsible party for completing each of these steps.</p> <p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> Internal Audit examined the checklist and process flow; no further audit follow-up is required.</p>		

	Finding	Recommendations	Corrective Action Plan
3	Enhance Security of Documents		
	The physical security and cybersecurity of applicants' PII may be compromised with the current administration's methodology.	We recommend physical security and cybersecurity surrounding the collection, distribution, and retention of Personal Identifying Information be enhanced to ensure it meets current industry standards and adequately protects individuals' Personal Identifying Information from malicious or inadvertent disclosure.	The PII included in recruiting documents is not expansive and carries limited risk. Civil Service Staff will work with Human Resources and IT to identify all employees who have access to applicant information as collected by Civil Service during the application process and distributed during the hiring process. Best practices and policies will be established, communicated, and implemented timely. Implementation in coordination with IT per City Policy 103 will be provided by June 30, 2024.
	<u>Recommendation has been implemented.</u> During the second quarter hiring team meetings training was provided on handling candidate's personal information contained on applications. Best practice recommendations were shared with the City's hiring teams that included maintaining candidate applications in their secure repository (NeoGov). To facilitate this, Civil Service has provided access and training to more of the City's hiring team so that they can all access this information in NeoGov instead of printing out copies. Recommendations were also made to hiring team members regarding printed materials that include maintaining strict security of documents in locke and/or other protective measures and to shred physical copies and delete any electronic copies that exist outside of NeoGov at the end of the hiring process. We also worked with IT to add single-sign on access to NeoGov but that option was deemed too expensive at this time to implement. Since Civil Service cannot make City policy, we were only able to train on best practices.		
	<u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> This item has been sufficiently completed with a clear plan for implementation and sufficient management oversight; no further audit follow-up is required.		
4	Include Proper Supporting Documentation		
	Without supporting documentation which identifies the business purpose of the meetings that include City-purchased food and beverages, verifying compliance with citywide policies is not possible.	We recommend, for expenditures that include food or beverage, the supporting documentation include the business purpose for the meeting.	Civil Service staff will implement an updated process to include an information sheet with supporting details surrounding the purchase of food and beverages to include the purpose, the date and a list of participants. Once a formal process or form is developed by Finance or Purchasing, we will implement that into our accounts payable process. These changes will occur on December 1, 2023.
	<u>Recommendation has been implemented.</u> Implemented new department procedure to provide and attach an event sign in sheet for participants at all events, trainings and assessment centers where Civil Service will be providing food and beverages. The procedure also includes documenting on all invoices the purpose for purchasing the F/B and the date, the sign in sheet is attached. This procedure will remain in place until the City establishes a City wide process for documenting these types of purchases, where at that time we will adopt the city's process.		
	<u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> This item has been sufficiently completed with a clear plan for implementation and sufficient management oversight; no further audit follow-up is required.		

	Finding	Recommendations	Corrective Action Plan
5	<p>Provide Hiring Manager Training Periodically</p> <p>A systematic, iterative program to train departmental hiring managers on the Civil Service processes and rules has not been formalized.</p> <p>Without required appropriate and periodic training, compliance with Civil Service processes, Civil Service rules, and citywide policies may be compromised.</p>	<p>We recommend a systematic, iterative training program be developed by Civil Service and implemented to ensure hiring managers receive formal training on which portions of the recruitment process are covered under the Civil Service processes and rules. In addition, we recommend hiring managers be required to participate in the formal training provided by Civil Service.</p>	<p>Civil Service staff is currently providing routine training to Directors, hiring managers and other staff that utilize the NeoGov applicant tracking system. NeoGov support training is provided to all authorized NeoGov users and is administered whenever a new user is identified.</p> <p>Quarterly training on various Civil Service processes and rules are covered during the regularly scheduled hiring team meetings with departments. Civil Service staff will continue to provide these in-depth trainings on specific rules and process that include the portions of the recruitment process covered by Civil Service. Director and hiring manager attendance at regularly scheduled meetings/trainings is sporadic and interferes with our ability to provide valuable information to them.</p> <p>This is a continuing effort that will culminate in a formal training program that can be provided to new directors and hiring managers as they are being onboarded.</p> <p>Training will be provided at the quarterly training meetings beginning in 2024</p>
	<p><u>Recommendation has been partially implemented.</u></p> <p>During the first and second quarterly hiring team meetings, Civil Service continued to provide information and training on requisition and recruitment process. These along with Civil Service Rules are a part of all quarterly meetings. The quarterly meetings with the City's hiring teams allows us to provide regular and consistent information surrounding the Civil Service processes and rules. We have reached out to Human Resources multiple times to gain access to the City's Learning System, Moodle to put together a comprehensive formal training that can be accessed by all current and new hiring managers but have not been granted access at yet. Without access to a platform like Moodle, we do not have the resources to facilitate this type of training on an individual basis.</p> <p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> While the recommendation implementation for Civil Service has been completed, Internal Audit will follow-up on a the status of the comprehensive and iterative formal training program in coordination with HR.</p>		

Finding	Recommendations	Corrective Action Plan
6 Provide Staff Training Periodically		
<p>Training opportunities are being developed and implemented for Civil Service staff, but these training programs are ad hoc at this point and not a standardized program for Civil Service staff. A lack of standardized training creates uneven knowledge between personnel of the same level and performing the same duties.</p>	<p>We recommend the training programs currently being delivered on an ad hoc basis be formalized and a standard training routine be implemented and documented through training manuals to ensure all employees of a similar title and workload are receiving the same training.</p>	<p>Institute an Analyst training tracker that identifies the skills and tasks required of the Analyst position and documents that training and progress of proficiency similar to the one currently in use for the Civil Service Technician position.</p> <p>Continue to update training materials and operations manuals to reflect current processes and procedures.</p> <p>Training tracker will be developed and implemented by June 30, 2024 and training materials and operation manuals will be updated by December 31, 2024.</p>
<p><u>The Civil Service recommendation has been implemented.</u></p> <p>The Civil Service Technician new employee training tracker and manual have been updated. The training tracker is an e-doc that outlines areas of responsibility and training/learning progress. The manual is a hard copy binder that has been updated to reflect current processes and procedures. A Civil Service Analyst training tracker for new employees has also been developed, along with an online training folder that has been updated to reflect current processes and procedures. Both of our new employees in each of these areas is currently utilizing these tools to guide their training and development in their new roles. Standardized training has been identified to include webinars and virtual learning opportunities that all new analyst will attend, these include Civil Service 101 presented by Foster Garvey and Job Analysis, Item Writing and Pass Point Analysis presented by I/O Predict. Other training opportunities have been identified for the more senior analyst in the department to include The Art of Classification presented by WRIPAC and the annual IPAC (International Personnel Assessment Council) conference and pre-conference. Staff has also been allocated up to 5% to focus on their own personal and professional development, including but not limited to earning professional development credits for their PHR recertification.</p> <p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> Internal Audit examined the manual and training edoc; no further audit follow-up is required.</p>		
		<p>The City Manager will work with HR to identify and develop a training program and personnel required to participate in classes specific to hiring manager competencies.</p> <p>Legal and Effective Interviewing and Hiring training courses is scheduled to launch in February 2024.</p>
<p><u>The City Manager's Office recommendation has been partially implemented.</u></p> <p>City-wide learning was collaboratively provided by the Human Resources and Civil Service Departments as part of the Leader Track series, and was open to all employees. The learning sessions were titled Interviewing & Hiring - Legal and Effective. This learning session was offered on two different date/times (02/15/2024 4:00 - 5:00 p.m. and 02/20/2024 from 7:30 - 8:30 a.m.) in an effort to make it accessible for a variety of employee schedules.</p> <p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> This item has been sufficiently completed with a clear plan for implementation and sufficient management oversight; no further audit follow-up is required.</p>		
7 Provide Training on Personal Identifying Information Security		
<p>Standardized training on the treatment of PII is not provided to employees with access to it. Without appropriate training, the physical security and cybersecurity of individuals' PII may be compromised.</p>	<p>We recommend formal training be provided to all hiring managers and Civil Service staff as it relates to physical security and cybersecurity for the collection, distribution, and retention of Personal Identifying Information to meet industry best practices.</p>	<p>Civil Service Staff will work with Human Resources to identify all employees who have access to applicant information as collected by Civil Service during the application process.</p> <p>Civil Service will collaborate with Human Resources and IT to train employees regarding the safekeeping and protection of employee information captured and distributed through the application and hiring process.</p> <p>Training in coordination with IT per City Policy 103 will be provided by June 30, 2024.</p>

Finding	Recommendations	Corrective Action Plan
<p><u>Recommendation has been implemented.</u></p>		
<p>During the second quarter hiring team meetings training was provided on handling candidate's personal information contained on applications. Best practice recommendations were shared with the City's hiring teams that included maintaining candidate applications in their secure repository (NeoGov). To facilitate this, Civil Service has provided access and training to more of the City's hiring team so that they can all access this information in NeoGov instead of printing out copies. Recommendations were also made to hiring team members regarding printed materials that include maintaining strict security of documents in locke and/or other protective measures and to shred physical copies and delete any electronic copies that exist outside of NeoGov at the end of the hiring process. We also worked with IT to add single-sign on access to NeoGov but that option was deemed too expensive at this time to implement. Since Civil Service cannot make City policy, we were only able to train on best practices.</p>		
<p><u>Internal Audit Comment:</u> While the recommendation implementation for Civil Service has been completed, Internal Audit will follow-up on a the status of the comprehensive and iterative formal training program in coordination with HR.</p>		